



NORTHEAST OHIO AREAWIDE COORDINATING AGENCY

MEMORANDUM

TO: NOACA Board of Directors

FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director

DATE: September 4, 2015

RE: **Resolution 2015-052**
Statewide Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) Project Priorities

ACTION REQUESTED

The Board of Directors is asked to approve the assignment of Regional Priority Points as required under the statewide CMAQ policy. Staff presented the project applications for information to the NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee and Transportation Subcommittee at their respective meetings on June 19th, and for recommendation of an approach for the assignment of regional priority points to the Planning and Programming Committee at their July 10th meeting.

BACKGROUND

In November 2012, ODOT directed the Ohio Association of Regional Councils (OARC) and its eight large Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) members to develop a statewide CMAQ Program. The statewide CMAQ program replaced the individual programs historically administered by the eight largest MPOs. In May, 2015, NOACA, along with the other statewide MPOs, announced the solicitation of applications for new projects targeted for implementation for state fiscal year 2021, or sooner, if funding is available. A summary of the applications received is attached to this memo.

NOACA staff has completed evaluation and scoring of each CMAQ application in accordance with the statewide program policy project scoring criteria. The criterion includes:

1. Project Type (10 points)
2. Cost Effectiveness (15 points)
3. Other Benefits (15 points)
4. Existing Level of Service (15 points)
5. Positive Impact on Level of Service (15 points)
6. Status of Project (10 points)
7. Non-Federal Match Commitments (10 points)
8. Regional Priority (10, 7, 4, 2 points based on top four project priorities)
9. History of Project Delivery (up to -10 points) (Not applicable this funding round)

Criteria # 8, Regional Priority, is the only one for which the MPOs individually assign points, thus permitting NOACA to directly impact the scoring. At the July 10th Planning and Programming Committee meeting, staff

requested specific input regarding the allocation of 'bonus points,' to be assigned in the denominations of 10, 7, 4, and 2 points to four regionally significant projects, as required by the Statewide CMAQ Program Policy. Several approaches were presented to the Committee as potential options for the assignment of these points. The Committee recommended that points be applied strategically by staff to maximize CMAQ funding to the region.

Based on that direction, staff is recommending that the bonus points be assigned to the top four scoring projects to maximize the opportunity to compete for the limited funds available. In accordance with this recommendation, bonus points would be assigned accordingly:

- 10 points – GCRTA 2021-2023 CNG Bus Replacements
- 7 points – GCRTA 2018-2020 CNG Vehicles
- 4 points – Laketran 2017-2022 Bus Replacements
- 2 points – Laketran 2017-2022 Light Transit Vehicle Replacements

Staff determined this recommendation in careful review of all projects against the following factors:

1. Greatest Regional impact - The GCRTA and Laketran bus purchases scored the highest and provide the largest regional benefit toward the program's goal to reduce mobile source emissions
2. Limited Funding Allocation - The statewide CMAQ amount available this round is \$50 M and is targeted for SFY 2021, or sooner, if funding is available. This is far less than the \$150 M that was available last round to fill the SFY 2016-2020 programs. There is less opportunity for funds to be spread any further than the top scoring projects given the statewide competition.
3. Availability of Alternate Funding Programs - NOACA has historically limited its Surface Transportation Program (STP) funds toward roadway related projects and its Transportation Alternatives Program (TAP) funds toward non-motorized transportation projects, as required by law. Transit vehicle replacements have not traditionally been funded through these programs, essentially limiting them to eligibility for NOACA CMAQ funding. CMAQ project applications received for roadway and non-motorized project types, including traffic signals, streetscape and bicycle improvements, will be amended to the NOACA Transportation Plan and can compete for STP and TAP funds in the development of the next 2018-2021 Transportation Improvement Program.

Staff distributed this recommendation by email to the Air Quality Subcommittee, Transportation Subcommittee, and Planning and Programming Committee on August 28th for review and comment. All comments received were in support of the recommended assignment of regional priority points.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There is no financial impact.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS

With Board approval, staff will assign regional priority points and submit recommended applications to the Statewide CMAQ Program Committee for evaluation against other statewide projects in September 2015, with final approvals expected in October 2015.

Attached: Summary of Statewide CMAQ Applications

GG/rl/2860b

2015 Statewide Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Program Applications

Revised: 8/26/2015

PRELIMINARY DRAFT SCORES

Sponsor Agency	County	Project Name and Description	Phase	Project Scoring							Project Costs			
				Project Type (10)	Cost Effectiveness (20)	Other Benefits (10)	Existing QOS (15)	Positive Impact QOS (15)	Status of Project (10)	Non-Federal Match (10)	Regional Priority (10)	TOTAL POINTS (100)	Total CMAQ Phase Costs	CMAQ Funds Request
RECOMMENDED FOR SUBMITTAL TO STATEWIDE CMAQ COMMITTEE														
GCRTA	CUY	GCRTA 2021-23 Vehicles Replace 105 vehicles (FY 2021 - Replace (15) 2001 and (2) 2003 MCI diesel 45' buses with (16) Commuter Diesel 45' buses); (FY 2021 - Replace (17) Series 3000 New Flyer Diesel 60' with (17) Diesel/CNG 60' vehicles); and (FY 2022 and 2023 - Replace (72) Series 2600/2800 NABI 40' buses (72) Gillig CNG buses).	Purchase	8	Scored by OSUCC	6	10	10	8	5	10	57	\$ 65,000,000	\$ 52,000,000
GCRTA	CUY	GCRTA 2018-20 Vehicles Replace 41 vehicles (FY 2018 and 2019 - Replace (20) Series 2600/2800 NABI Buses with (20) Gillig CNG buses); and (FY 2020 - Replace (21) Series 2900 New Flyer BRT Diesel Electric Hybrids with (21) CNG BRT vehicles).	Purchase	8	Scored by OSUCC	6	10	10	8	5	7	54	\$ 28,000,000	\$ 22,400,000
LAKETRAN	LAK	LAKETRAN 2017-22 Buses Replace 24 total buses, (8) 40' over the road coaches, (12) 35' low floor transit vehicles and (4) <30' low floor transit vehicles, 4-12 vehicles each year 2017 - 2022.	Purchase	8	Scored by OSUCC	5	10	10	8	5	4	50	\$ 12,719,056	\$ 10,175,245
LAKETRAN	LAK	LAKETRAN 2017-22 LTVs Replace 56 light transit vehicles, 8-12 vehicles each year 2017 - 2022.	Purchase	8	Scored by OSUCC	4	10	10	8	5	2	47	\$ 6,208,716	\$ 4,966,972
Beachwood	CUY	Beachwood Signals Replace signals at approximately 23 intersections, along Cedar Rd and Richmond Rd.	RW, CO	10	Scored by OSUCC	5	4	3	2	10	0	34	\$ 5,398,000	\$ 2,695,000
Cleveland	CUY	Lorain Ave Complete Street Project Enhance sidewalks, street crossings, transit waiting environments (bus shelters), reconfigure street and custom, two-way bicycle facility, sidewalks, pedestrian scale lighting and street amenities, in Cleveland	PEPD, PEDD, CO	4	Scored by OSUCC	4	4	10	2	4	0	28	\$ 5,500,000	\$ 4,400,000
Lorain	LOR	Lorain City Signals Replace traffic signals at 10 intersections along Broadway and 28th Street, in Lorain.	PEPD, CO	10	Scored by OSUCC	5	4	3	2	4	0	28	\$ 4,913,000	\$ 3,945,000
Cleveland Metroparks	CUY	Euclid Creek Greenway Construct 0.6 mile segment of all-purpose trail from the intersection of Euclid Creek Parkway and Highland Rd to a crosswalk at Euclid Ave and Chardon Rd the southernmost portion of the proposed Euclid Creek Greenway that is located on park property in Euclid.	PEPD, PEDD, CO	4	Scored by OSUCC	4	4	10	2	2	0	26	\$ 775,000	\$ 620,000
Avon	LOR	Avon Signals - Upgrade traffic signals at 16 intersections along Center Road (SR-83), Colorado Rd (SR-611) and Detroit Road (SR-254), in Avon.	CO	10	Scored by OSUCC	5	4	3	2	2	0	26	\$ 1,970,000	\$ 1,576,000
Carlisle Township	LOR	Elyria CNG Refuse Truck Deployment Project This application requests funding in the amount of \$1,816,534.08 (50% of incremental cost) to partially offset the incremental cost of 108 CNG refuse trucks.	Purchase	4	Scored by OSUCC	1	0	0	8	9	0	22	\$ 3,627,668	\$ 1,813,834
Brooklyn Heights	CUY	West Creek Greenway Trail (Shared Used Path/Sidepath) Construct shared use path from Snow Road to a riparian area, from Denzler Road south, west and east to just north of Pleasant Valley Dr to Broadview Rd, and from Crickett Road, east towards Edgewood and Hillside Dr, and north along I-77.	PEPD, PEDD, RW, CO	4	Scored by OSUCC	3	4	3	2	4	0	20	\$ 7,489,962	\$ 5,991,970
Rocky River	CUY	Rocky River Center Ridge Road Signals - Upgrade signals at 12 intersections along Center Ridge Road, from Spencer Road to Maslic Road	PEPD, PEDD, CO	10	Scored by OSUCC	5	0	0	2	2	0	19	\$ 2,310,000	\$ 1,848,000
Strongsville	CUY	Strongsville Citywide Signals Replace signals at 4 intersections and upgrade signals at 37 intersections along Pearl Rd (US-42) and Royallon Rd (SR-82).	CO	10	Scored by OSUCC	3	0	0	2	3	0	18	\$ 3,776,300	\$ 3,022,640
Brecksville	CUY	Brecksville Road Traffic Control Improvements Traffic control timing and signalization upgrades to signalized intersections along Brecksville Rd from Snowville Rd to Wallings Rd. Also includes intersections of SR-82 and Highland Rd and SR-82 and the entrance to the Heinen's.	PEPD, PEDD, CO	10	Scored by OSUCC	2	0	0	2	2	0	16	\$ 1,760,000	\$ 1,408,000
Cleveland Metroparks	CUY	CNG Vehicle Purchases and Retrofits This application requests funding in the amount of \$402,800 to purchase two 5-ton service trucks and retrofit five vehicles (4 35' Faber motor coach) to operate on CNG.	Purchase	4	Scored by OSUCC	1	0	0	8	1	0	14	\$ 503,500	\$ 402,800
Cleveland	CUY	East 140th Corridor Streetscape E. 140th corridor from Lakeshore Blvd to St. Clair Ave includes street trees, bike facilities, and improved transit waiting environments.	PEPD, PEDD, CO	4	Scored by OSUCC	3	0	0	2	4	0	13	\$ 1,659,960	\$ 1,320,000
Cleveland	CUY	Detroit Ave Streetscape Extension Extend existing streetscape amenities, including street trees, light poles with banners, transit waiting environments (bus shelters), decorative crosswalks and custom designed street furniture, from W. 73rd to W. 78th Street and from W. 58th to W. 52nd Street, respectively.	PEPD, PEDD, CO	4	Scored by OSUCC	3	0	0	2	3	0	12	\$ 726,000	\$ 605,000
NOT RECOMMENDED FOR SUBMITTAL TO STATEWIDE CMAQ COMMITTEE														
Beachwood	CUY	Chagrin Blvd. I-271 Ramps Upgrade Intersection, roadway and freeway interchange modifications including constructing a 2nd NB LTL at Chagrin Blvd/Richmond Rd, widening US-422, and widening the IR-271 NB and SB entrance ramps	CO										\$ 12,692,657	\$ 3,759,796
Cleveland	CUY	East 105th - East 93rd Transportation Corridor Complete Street includes roadway enhancements (roadway width changes, turn lanes, sidewalk, bump-outs, bike lanes, on-street parking changes and traffic management improvements), Bicycle and Pedestrian Enhancements, and Transit Enhancements	PEPD, PEDD, CO										\$ 50,854,400	\$ 40,832,000
\$ 63,547,057 \$ 44,591,796														

**RESOLUTION 2015-052
(STATEWIDE CONGESTION
MITIGATION AND AIR QUALITY
PROJECT PRIORITIES)**

**RESOLUTION OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS
OF THE
NORTHEAST OHIO AREAWIDE COORDINATING AGENCY**

WHEREAS, the Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA) is the Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) for the counties of Cuyahoga, Geauga, Lake, Lorain, and Medina, and the areawide water quality management agency for the same region; and

WHEREAS, in 2012, the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) directed the Ohio Association of Regional Councils (OARC), and its eight large Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) members, to develop a statewide Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) program ; and

WHEREAS, the statewide CMAQ program has replaced the individual programs historically administered by the eight largest MPOs; and

WHEREAS, the In May, 2015, NOACA, along with the other statewide MPOs, announced the solicitation of applications for new projects targeted for implementation for state fiscal year 2021; and

WHEREAS, NOACA staff has completed evaluation and scoring of each CMAQ application in accordance with the statewide program policy project scoring criteria; and

WHEREAS, NOACA has the ability to control the assignment of Regional Priority points in the denominations of 10, 7, 4, and 2 points to four regionally significant projects, as required by the statewide CMAQ program policy; and

WHEREAS, options for the Board's assignment of these points were presented to the Policy Committee for recommendation; and

WHEREAS, the Policy Committee recommended that points be applied strategically by staff to maximize CMAQ funding to the region; and

WHEREAS, the staff recommended that the bonus points be assigned to the top four scoring projects to maximize the opportunity to compete for the limited funds available; and

WHEREAS, staff determined this recommendation in careful review of all projects against factors associated with greatest regional air quality benefits, the limited amount of statewide program funding available, and the availability of alternate funding programs; and

WHEREAS, staff distributed the recommended approach for the assignment of priority points to the Air Quality Subcommittee, Transportation Subcommittee, and Planning and Programming Committee for review and concurrence.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Board of Directors of the Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency, consisting of 45 principal officials serving general purpose local governments throughout and within the counties of Cuyahoga, Geauga, Lake, Lorain, and Medina that:

Section 1: Regional priority points will be assigned to CMAQ projects and applications will be submitted to the Ohio Statewide Urban CMAQ Committee.

**RESOLUTION 2015-052
(STATEWIDE CONGESTION
MITIGATION AND AIR QUALITY
PROJECT PRIORITIES)**

Section 2: The Executive Director is authorized to transmit certified copies of this resolution to appropriate federal, state, and local agencies.

Certified to be a true copy of a Resolution of the Board of Directors of the Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency adopted this 11th day of September 2015.

Secretary: *Michael P. ...*

Date Signed: *September 11, 2015*